



Economic Development and Planning Committee 2008 BUDGET

REPORT 08-001

**January 8, 2008
January 22, 2008
February 12, 2008**

Hamilton, Ontario

**January 8, 2008
Albion Room, Hamilton Convention Centre**

Present: Chair T. Whitehead

Mayor F. Eisenberger, 1st Vice-Chair M. Pearson
Councillors: B. Bratina, B. Clark, S. Duvall, L. Ferguson,
B. McHattie, D. Mitchell

Absent with regrets: Councillor R. Pasuta-vacation

Staff Present: G. Peace, City Manager
J. Rinaldo, General Manager, Finance and Corporate
Services
T. McCabe, General Manager – Planning and Development
P. Mallard, R. Marini, T. Sergi, J. Spolnik, R. Marini,
M. Hazell, G. Paparella, S. O'Dwyer, C. Andruschko,
N. Everson, D. Adames
– Planning and Development
A. Rawlings and I. Sturgeon– City Clerk's Office

January 22, 2008

Hamilton Wentworth District School Board Auditorium

Present: Chair T. Whitehead

Mayor F. Eisenberger, 1st Vice-Chair M. Pearson
Councillors: B. Bratina, B. Clark, S. Duvall, D. Mitchell,
R. Pasuta, M. McCarthy

Absent with regrets: Councillor L. Ferguson – Personal Business
Councillor B. McHattie - Illness

Staff Present: G. Peace, City Manager
J. Rinaldo, General Manager, Finance and Corporate
Services
T. McCabe, General Manager – Planning and Development
P. Mallard, R. Marini, T. Sergi, J. Spolnik, C. Burnett,
M. Hazell, G. Paparella, S. O'Dwyer, C. Andruschko,
B. Janssen, D. Ortiz – Planning and Development
R. Sabo – Legal
D. Adames – Economic Development
A. Rawlings– Co-ordinator, City Clerk's Office

February 12, 2008

Albion Room, Hamilton Convention Centre

Present: Chair T. Whitehead

Mayor F. Eisenberger,
1st Vice-Chair M. Pearson 2nd Vice Chair L. Ferguson
Councillors: B. Bratina, B. Clark, S. Duvall, B. McHattie
D. Mitchell, R. Pasuta

Staff Present: G. Peace, City Manager
J. Rinaldo, General Manager, Finance and Corporate
Services
T. McCabe, General Manager – Planning and Development
M. Hazell, B. Young, P. Carver, S. Reeder, P. Brown,
C. Andruschko – Planning and Development
R. Sabo – Legal
A. Rawlings– Co-ordinator, City Clerk's Office

**THE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND PLANNING COMMITTEE PRESENTS
REPORT 08-001 AND RESPECTFULLY RECOMMENDS:**

**1. Downtown Projects – Details and Cost Analysis (PED07123(b)/FCS07068)
(Wards 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8) (Item 5.1)**

That sections (j) and (k) of Downtown Projects – Details and Cost Analysis (PED07123(b)/FCS07068) be received for information.

2. 2008 Tax Supported Operating Budget (FCS08004)(City Wide) (Item 5.2)

That Report FCS08004, 2008 Tax Supported Operating Budget, be received for information.

**3. Tax Supported Operating Budget-Planning and Economic Development
(FCS08004c) (City Wide)**

a) That the 2008 unaffordable Council referred items (see Appendix Two attached to Report FCS08004(c)) be received for information.

b) That the 2008 net operating levy for Planning and Economic Development, inclusive of Council approved referred items, \$16,751,160. be received for information, and that staff be directed to identify further revenue sources.

4. Additional Revenues from Plate Denial

That the amount of fine revenues collected through plate denial in the current budget be adjusted upwards by \$100,000 to \$250,000 for 2008.

5. Anti-Idling Enforcement (Item 3.1)

(a) That one time funding, in the amount of \$76,000, for an Anti-Idling By-law Enforcement Officer be approved.

(b) That staff be authorized and directed to lease a hybrid vehicle, for use by the Anti-Idling By-law Enforcement Officer, at a cost yet to be determined.

6. Costs for Pesticide By-law Enforcement (Item 3.2)

That Item 3.2 – Costs for Pesticide By-law Enforcement be received and no further action taken at this time.

7. Operational and Financial Process Review of the Building Services Division (PED07071(a)) (City Wide) (Item 5.1)

- (a) That the Operational and Financial Process Review of the Building Services Division of the Planning and Economic Development Department submitted by BMA Management Consulting Inc., May 2007, attached as Appendix 'A' to Report 08-001, be received.
- (b) That the proposed Operational Review Work Plan attached as Appendix 'B' to Report 08-001 be received and that Council endorse thirty-seven (37) of the forty-two (42) Recommendations; being Nos. 1, 2, 4 to 14, 17 to 20, 22, 24 to 26, 28, and 30 to 42, all inclusive.
- (c) That Option Two of Recommendation No. 15 to further explore the support needed to be provided by Corporate Information Technology Services Division to the AMANDA System be referred to the Information Technology Strategy Team for consideration.
- (d) That Recommendation No. 16 requiring an additional \$15,180.00 from the City's levy and \$86,000.00 from the Building Services Enterprise System for an additional 1.0 FTE to hire a Co-ordinator Customer Service position in the Customer Service Section be approved. Further, this be implemented by amending the Building Services Division 2008 Operating Budget submission by:
 - (i) Increasing the 2008 FTE complement to 86.72.
 - (ii) Decreasing the net FTE reduction from 3.18 to 2.18.
 - (iii) By directing that the additional \$15,180.00 budget impact be paid from the Development Fee Stabilization Reserve.
- (e) That Recommendation No. 21 regarding the permanent assignment of Customer Service Representatives (Level I) to front counter duties be referred to the Building Services Director for review and implementation as appropriate.
- (f) That Recommendation No. 27 regarding the creation of a dedicated Grading Inspection and Enforcement Team be further investigated with respect to appropriate alignment of responsibilities, staff resources required, budget impact and an implementation strategy, and that staff report back with a recommendation on this matter to the Building Operational Review Sub-Committee in the third quarter of 2008.

- (g) That Recommendation No. 29 regarding the transferring of site plan inspection and enforcement responsibilities from the Building Inspector function be further reviewed in respect to appropriate alignment of responsibilities, staff resources required, budget impact and an implementation strategy, and that staff report back with a recommendation to the Building Operational Review Sub-Committee in the second quarter of 2008.

January 8, 2008

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)

The Clerk advised of the following changes:

Additional handout respecting budget details from Planning staff distributed this morning.

The Agenda for the January 8, 2008, meeting of the Economic Development & Planning Committee was approved, as amended.

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)

None

(c) APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item 3)

None

**(d) Downtown Projects – Details and Cost Analysis (PED07123(b)/FCS07068)
(Wards 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8) (Item 5.1)**

Tim McCabe explained that the information contained in the report had already been included elsewhere in the Budget documents.

Committee received sections (j) and (k) as information.

(e) 2008 Tax Supported Operating Budget (FCS08004)(City Wide) (Item 5.2)

Joe Rinaldo noted that the subject Report had been included as background information in all of the Standing Committee Budget Agendas.

Committee received the report for information.

(f) 2008 Tax Supported Operating Budget – Planning and Economic Development (FCS08004c) (City Wide) (Item 5.3)

Tim McCabe gave an overview of the departmental budget, with the aid of a powerpoint presentation. Mr. McCabe advised Committee that the budget being discussed today did not include the Economic Development Budget, which had been considered by Council before Christmas. A copy of the presentation was provided to the Committee members.

Highlights of the budget presentation included;

- transition to the new departmental organization well underway, but will take further 2-3 years to complete, re-organization has not added to the tax levy. Changes include new positions in Economic Development, Communications Officer, Industrial Parks and Airport moved from Economic Development into Planning;
- fee increases in various areas will increase revenues, some new fees proposed e.g. demolition permits
- overall budget increase of Planning and Development budget is currently 2.4%, but impact will be 12.5% when Economic Development included
- some staff are paid for from Development Stabilization reserve
- Animal Control Operations Review completed, Building Services Operations Review approaching completion

Committee discussed the budget presentation and had further information supplied by staff. Committee highlighted a number of questions areas of concern, including but not limited to, the following;

- need to be provided with detailed spreadsheet of the budget numbers
- need additional breakdown of all revenues in budget
- need to review ways of increasing revenues, adding new sources
- need to get new staff positions in place as soon as possible
- area of by-law enforcement needs review, use of officers across all areas to be considered, need for generalists not specialists expressed, concern about adding new enforcement staff
- question of unpaid parking fines/plate denial since amalgamation needs further review, question of pursuing this with Ministry of the Attorney General, as discussions of staff level have not produced satisfactory response.

- Anti-Idling By-law enforcement – how can the by-law be legally enforced, in most efficient and cost-effective way. Various alternatives considered, enforcement on a six-month pilot project basis discussed.
- Need to review further education opportunities, new signage for Anti-Idling By-law, including signs at entry points to City, in areas adjacent to school drop-offs, City parks
- Methods of enforcement of by-laws reviewed, will be addressed in Operational Review, but need for answers earlier than June
- Need to look for efficiencies in use of enforcement staff and in enforcement of existing by-laws

Following the discussion, staff was directed to review and report back to the next budget meeting on January 22, 2008, on the following items:

- Prepare further breakdown of figures within Revenues presented in the handout at meeting
- Search for new/enhanced revenue sources-including
 - raising fines in general
 - Raising parking fines from \$12.00 to \$20.00
 - raising sign fines now, ahead of the expected review, consider doubling them
- Review enforcement positions and tasks assigned with view to having multi tasking officers, cross training of enforcement staff, targeting of enforcement areas/subjects as needed through the year, to avoid hiring single purpose enforcement staff
- Remove the new enforcement position for the 1 bag garbage limit as no longer needed
- Review background to plate denial issue and collection of fines back to amalgamation, and report back with details
- Review possibility of anti -idling enforcement for a 6 month Pilot Project, starting second half of 2008
- Review costings of “Anti-Idling Community” signage for entry signs to City, and other signage, including bumper stickers for City vehicles

In addition, staff was directed to send copies of budget spread sheet, as discussed at the meeting, to all members of Committee, (and to 3 hole punch all paper copies, from now on).

Members of Committee received the report.

January 22, 2008

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)

The Clerk advised of the following changes:

Minutes from the meeting of January 8, 2008, added as item 3.1.

Additional handout from Planning staff, being part of Item 5.1

The Agenda for the January 22, 2008, meeting of the Economic Development & Planning Committee was approved, as amended.

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)

None

(c) APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item 3)

The Minutes of the Budget Meeting of January 8, 2008, were approved, as presented.

(d) Supplementary Budget Information Requested at the January 8, 2008 Economic Development and Planning Committee (PED08046) (City Wide) (Item 5.1)

Tim McCabe gave an overview of the supplementary budget information. Mr. McCabe noted that the total revenue for the department is \$26.4 million, and that a new approach to the structure of the building permit fees is proposed. In addition, a fee review is underway in the Planning and Development area, where further increases will lead to an increase in departmental revenue.

Mr. McCabe noted that staff would return to Committee in February or March, with details of new fees for licensing and enforcement. He requested Committee's consideration of whether there should be public input on some of the recommendations to be presented by Mr. Hazell.

Marty Hazell then provided an overview of the Parking and By-law Services area of the proposed budget, with the aid of a powerpoint presentation. A copy of the presentation was provided to all members of Committee.

Highlights of the presentation included the following:

- staff has reviewed all 70 revenue lines and found 7 where possible increases should be considered. If all 7 are accepted, a potential of \$1.5 million in new revenues would be available.

- Parking fines – current fine of \$12.00 for exceeding time limit in residential areas not sufficient to deter parking all day; \$26.00 is Ontario median; staff is proposing increase to \$20.00; need for Provincial approval for set fines, this revenue generated would be for 6 months of 2008.
- Fire Route Regulations – Ontario median fine for parking in fire route is \$77.00, staff is proposing increase from \$20 to \$50. Change needs by-law amendment and Provincial approval.
- Heavy truck parking violation – Ontario median \$94.00, staff proposing increase from \$50 to \$75, needs change in by-law and Provincial approval.
- Parking Meter Rates – meter rates for on-street parking currently 50 cents per hour, staff recommending increase to \$1.00 per hour.
- Paid parking expansion – Citywide study of parking underway, all municipalities had own, varied parking regulations, need to be harmonized. Transportation Master Plan also under way, may have impacts on parking. Staff proposing consideration be given to expanding paid parking into all commercial areas in City.
- Animal Revenues – staff proposing increases in 7 areas, all of which support responsibility in pet owners. Cal Burnett provided additional information.
- Anti-Idling By-law – various ways to proceed, staff suggested item be referred to Operational Review for further consideration respecting enforcement.
- Signage for Anti-Idling By-law would cost \$60,000, including \$10,000 for signs at entry roads to City.
- Plate denial until parking fines paid – staff has contacted Ministry, obtained verbal agreement that City can collect outstanding parking fines back to 2002.
- Sign By-law Enforcement – education process ongoing, Province has not yet approved set fine schedule, so no fines being collected.

Committee discussed the budget presentation and had further information supplied by staff. Committee highlighted a number of questions areas of concern, including but not limited to, the following;

- should parking meter fees, and other fines be increased to Ontario average. Staff explained that proposed increases are interim increases, pending comprehensive review, need to consider all fines in context and defensible. Staff agreed to complete overall review of the fine structure, and report back to Committee at next Budget Meeting.
- Consideration of extension of paid parking across City, issues of fairness, potential increase in congestion on some streets, costs and timing for City of extending paid parking, use of paid parking for “traffic calming”, benefits of paid parking to merchants and public, public acceptance of paid parking, how parking fits into context of Transportation Master Plan.
- Details of Animal Control fees, what can be done to improve level of purchase of dog tags, maintaining free “First Ride Home” for stray dogs with a license, ways to promote responsible pet ownership.
- Anti-Idling By-law – concerns about education v. enforcement, disappointment respecting amount of education which has taken place,

methods of enforcement and its costs. Legal staff explained by-law currently has clause stating enforcement will commence June 1, 2008, and that this could be amended.

NOTE: AT THEIR MEETING OF FEBRUARY 12, 2008, COMMITTEE REFERRED MOTIONS (i), (ii), and (iii) TO A SPECIAL COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE BUDGET MEETING, TO TAKE PLACE AHEAD OF THE REGULAR BUDGET PROCESS;

Following the discussion, the following Motions were passed;

(i) Parking meter rate increase

(Pearson/Bratina)

That the City Parking By-law 01-218 be amended to increase the on-street parking meter rates to \$1.00 per hours, Citywide.

CARRIED

Councillor Clark requested that his opposition be recorded.

(ii) Paid parking in all commercial areas of City

(Duvall/Clark)

That paid parking be expanded into all commercial areas of the City.

CARRIED

Councillor Mitchell requested that his opposition be recorded.

(iii) Increase in Animal Control Fees

(Mitchell/Eisenberger)

That the increase in various animal control fees, proposed by staff in the handout provided to Committee on January 22, 2008, be approved, as amended, to maintain the "first ride home free" policy for dogs, with the second and subsequent rides home being increased to \$30.00.

CARRIED

(iv) Anti-Idling Enforcement

(Eisenberger/Pearson)

That the methods of enforcement of the Anti-Idling By-law be forwarded to the Building and Licensing Operational Review Sub-Committee Meeting of February 13, 2008, for review, to include extending education until 2009, and amending the By-law accordingly, and report back to Economic Development and Planning Committee, before the end of the 2008 budget process.

CARRIED

(v) **Anti-Idling Signage**
(Clark/Eisenberger)

That anti-idling signage be referred back to staff for review and recommendation respecting the strategic placement of signs, and for review and recommendation respecting the details of the education programme and the additional resources required.

CARRIED

(vi) **Additional revenues from plate denial**

Committee agreed that the amount of revenue from plate denial in the budget should be increased.

NOTE: AT THEIR MEETING OF FEBRUARY 12, 2008, COMMITTEE REFERRED THE FOLLOWING ITEM TO COUNCIL OF FEBRUARY 13, 2008, FOR IMMEDIATE ACTION

(vii) (Clark/Pearson)

That City Council send a letter to the Ministry of the Attorney General thanking him for his assistance in this important matter, and confirming his staff's agreement that the City may process fine collections respecting plate denial back until 2002.

CARRIED

(viii) **Sign Enforcement/Fines**

(Pearson/Clark)

That staff continue to refine enforcement procedures and that any changes to the fine levels associated with the Sign By-law be dealt with as part of the comprehensive staff report due by June, 2008.

CARRIED

(ix) **Increase in Fines**

(Clark/Pearson)

That staff undertake a complete review of fines giving consideration to the Provincial average for such fines, and how to move towards implementation of increased fees, and report back prior to the completion of the 2008 Budget process.

CARRIED

(e) Increase in Fines

Staff confirmed that they would report back to the next Budget Meeting, respecting the overall review of parking and other fines.

Councillor Mitchell noted that Councillor Ferguson had requested that the decision on extending paid parking in commercial areas be held off until he was present. Staff confirmed that the decisions and directions of the Committee were not final at this stage of the budget process.

Tim McCabe said that he would send an email to all Committee members with information about numbers of animals abandoned in Flamborough and Glanbrook.

Joe Rinaldo provided information on the relative costs of providing animal control services by contractors / providing services in-house.

Mayor Eisenberger noted the need to ensure that the public process for input into the budget is ongoing, and the need to set at least two additional dates for public meetings. The Clerk agreed to take the Mayor's direction back to the Clerk.

February 12, 2008**(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)**

The Clerk advised that there were no changes to the Agenda.

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)

None

(c) APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item 3)

Councillor Pearson moved an amendment to the Minutes, respecting the expansion of paid parking to all commercial areas of the City.

Committee considered the potential impact of expanding paid parking into all commercial areas, the views of HABIA and the individual BIAs, and the study on the issue which is currently being undertaken by consultants.

Mr. McCabe explained that the consultants' report should be available prior to the conclusion of the 2008 Budget process. He added that the consultants would be requested to do a presentation to Committee.

Committee noted the impatience of public input on this type of change, and questioned whether the timing of the consultants' report would allow the public to comment at the upcoming Special Committee of the Whole on February 28, 2008.

The Clerk was directed to provide details to all Councillors respecting the Special Committee of the Whole Meeting for public delegations.

Councillor Ferguson and Councillor McHattie expressed further concerns about how the expansion of paid parking into new areas would be handled.

Marty Hazell explained that consultations had taken place with affected groups, and that these discussions will continue. He noted that the consultants are looking at the harmonization of the various parking rules across the City, with a view to ensuring consistency and fairness.

The following amendment to the Minutes was put;

(Pearson/Clark)

That Information Item (d)(ii) be amended to read as follows:

That paid parking be expanded into all commercial areas of the City.

CARRIED

(Pearson/Clark)

The Minutes of the Budget Meeting of January 22, 2008, were approved, as amended.

CARRIED

(d) Supplementary Budget Information Requested at the January 22, 2008 Economic Development and Planning Committee – Increasing Parking Fines to Provincial Averages (PED08059) (City Wide)

Marty Hazell recognized his staff who had assisted in the budget preparation, Pam Carver, Susan Reeder and Paul Brown.

Mr. Hazell then provided an overview of the supplementary budget information, with the aid of a powerpoint presentation and highlighted the comparisons of City fines with the Provincial averages. He explained the overall purpose and operations of the Parking Enforcement process.

Highlights of the presentation included the following points:

- Council sets parking fines, then approval needed from the Province
- Hamilton presently has reduced fines when payment made early, most other large municipalities do not have reduced fines, pros and cons of this approach
- New parking fine revenues of \$420,000 identified in staff review
- Will need a new adjudicator for added court load, mainly for work-load of "plate-denial"
- Caution here, that if City increases fines, people may comply with regulations, and actual revenues may fall, this can be monitored
- Committee discussed the information from staff, and the following points were expressed
- significant additional revenue from parking fines will be received, this will help budget process
- how can implementation of parking fee increases be speeded up?

Councillor Clark suggested the item respecting plate denial for unpaid fines, as previously discussed, should not wait until the overall budget approval, but should be acted upon immediately.

(Eisenberger/Clark)

That City Council send a letter immediately to the Attorney General, thanking him for his assistance respecting the matter of plate denial for unpaid fines, and respectfully requesting confirmation of his staff's agreement that the City may process fine collections, respecting plate denial back to 2002.

CARRIED

Committee directed that the Clerk ensure that this matter be placed before Council on February 13, 2008.

Committee then discussed ways in which the parking fine increases, the animal control fee increases, and the plate denial could be expedited and had additional information supplied by Planning and Legal staff on the legal and practical requirements.

Councillor Bratina expressed his concerns that the City is proposing to increase parking meter changes and expand paid parking, while we are not requiring motorists to pay for the Red Hill Parkway maintenance, and we are considering a bridge over the QEW.

Committee discussed the proposed elimination of the early payment option of parking fines and the issue of fines for truck parking on streets. Committee had additional information supplied by staff.

Councillor Bratina proposed that the idea of sharing parking meter revenue with the BIAs, should be revisited. Committee then discussed the possibility of sharing such revenues with merchants' associations.

Committee agreed that the budget items discussed should be fast-tracked ahead of the regular budget process.

(Clark/Pearson)

That the fine for a heavy vehicle parking off a truck route be increased from \$75.00 to \$125.00.

CARRIED

(Bratina/Mitchell)

That consideration be given to some revenue sharing from parking meter receipts, with the BIAs, and staff report back to Committee of the Whole, respecting this issue.

CARRIED

(Ferguson/McHattie)

That the City not eliminate the early payment option for parking fines during 2008, and that further consideration be given to this item in the 2009 Budget process.

CARRIED

Councillors Pearson, Clark and Whitehead requested that their opposition be recorded.

Committee agreed that the staff presentation by Planning staff should be made at a Special Budget Committee of the Whole Meeting.

(Clark/Ferguson)

- (i) That the entire package of fine and fee increases, as considered by the Economic Development and Planning Committee be forwarded to a

Special Committee of the Whole for consideration and approval thereafter by Council, ahead of the regular 2008 Budget process;

- (ii) And that Committee of the Whole be advised that Economic Development and Planning Committee endorse the increase in parking meter charges, the extension of paid parking to all commercial areas, the increase in animal control fees, the increase in parking fines and fines for parking of heavy vehicles, the consideration of the potential of sharing some parking meter receipts with the BIAs and the retention of the reduced early payment fees for parking fines.

CARRIED

The Clerk was directed to ensure that the appropriate Motion be placed before Council on February 13, 2008.

February 19, 2008

At their meeting of February 19, 2008, Economic Development and Planning Committee considered additional budget items, from Report 08-001 of the Building and Licencing Division Operational Review Sub-Committee. These items related to Anti-Idling, costs for the Pesticide By-law enforcement and costs for the Operational and Financial Process Review of the Building Services Division. Committee referred all these matters to the Committee of the Whole Budget process.

Respectfully submitted,

Terry Whitehead, Chair
Economic Development and Planning Committee

Alexandra Rawlings, Co-ordinator
Economic Development and Planning Committee
February 19, 2008