



## **AUDIT, FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE MINUTES 11-013**

Wednesday, November 23, 2011

9:30 a.m.

Council Chambers

City Hall

71 Main Street West

Hamilton, Ontario

---

**Present:** Councillors B. Clark (Chair), B. Morelli and M. Pearson

**Absent with  
Regrets:** Councillors B. Johnson (Vice Chair) and R. Powers – Vacation

**Also Present:** Councillor C. Collins  
R. Rossini, General Manager, Finance & Corporate Services  
R. Caterini, City Clerk  
M. Gallagher, Deputy Clerk  
H. Hale Tomasik, Executive Director, HR & Organizational Dev.  
A. Zuidema, Director, Corporate Initiatives  
T. Tollis, City Treasurer  
D. Blaisis, Manager, Employment Services  
Deputy Chief K. Leendertse, Hamilton Police Service  
Staff Sergeant S. Hahn, Executive Officer to the Chief of Police  
A. Pekaruk, Director of Audit Services  
B. Minard, Intermediate Internal Auditor  
S. Paparella, Legislative Assistant, Office of the City Clerk

### **THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REPORTED TO COUNCIL FOR CONSIDERATION:**

- 1. Tax Appeals Under Sections 357 and 358 of the Municipal Act, 2001, as amended (FCS11003(g)) (City Wide) (Item 5.1)**

**(Pearson/Morelli)**

- (a)** That Appendix “A” attached to Report FCS11003(g) respecting the “Tax Write-Offs processed under Section 357 of the Municipal Act, 2001”, in the amount of \$29,695 be approved;

- (b) That Appendix "B" attached to Report FCS11003(g) respecting the "Tax Appeals due to a Gross or Manifest Clerical Error, Pursuant to Section 358 of the Municipal Act, 2001", in the amount of \$11,929 be approved.

**CARRIED**

**2. Monthly Status Report of Tenders and Requests for Proposals for September 10, 2011 to October 14, 2011 (FCS11004(f)) (City Wide) (Item 5.2)**

**(Morelli/Pearson)**

That Report FCS11004(f), respecting the Monthly Status Report of Tenders and Requests for Proposals for September 10, 2011 to October 14, 2011, be received.

**CARRIED**

**3. Quarterly Report on the Use of Policy 10 – Emergency Purchasing, and Policy 11 – Negotiations for the 3<sup>rd</sup> Quarter of 2011(FCS11005(b)) (City Wide) (Item 5.3)**

**(Morelli/Pearson)**

That Report FCS11005(b), respecting the Quarterly Report on the Use of Policy 10 – Emergency Purchasing; and, Policy 11– Negotiations for the 3<sup>rd</sup> Quarter of 2011, be received.

**CARRIED**

**4. Human Resources Employment Services Provided to Individual Departments (HUR11013) (City Wide) (Item 5.4)**

**(Morelli/Pearson)**

That Report HUR11013, respecting Human Resources Employment Services Provided to Individual Departments, be received.

**CARRIED**

**5. Treasurers Apportionment of Land Taxes for Properties in Flamborough and Stoney Creek (FCS11001(f)) (Wards 15 and 9) (Item 5.5)**

**(Pearson/Morelli)**

- (a) That the 2010 land taxes in the amount of \$1,480 for 15-25 Browview Drive, Flamborough, (Roll #2518 303 420 23035 0000) be apportioned and split amongst the six newly created parcels as set out in Appendix A to report FCS11001(f);

- (b) That the 2011 property taxes in the amount of \$3,622 for 29–43 Bankfield Crescent, (Roll #2518 003 850 00190 00000 be apportioned and split amongst the eight newly created parcels as set out in Appendix A to report FCS11001(f).

**CARRIED**

**6. Hamilton Wentworth Retirement Fund (HWRF) - December 31, 2010 Valuation (FCS11087) (City Wide) (Item 5.6)**

**(Pearson/Morelli)**

- (a) That the December 31, 2010, actuarial valuation for the Hamilton Street Railway Plan (1994), attached as Appendix 'A' to Report FCS11087, be received for information;
- (b) That the Treasurer be authorized to file the December 31, 2010, actuarial valuation with the Financial Services Commission of Ontario (FSCO) and Canada Revenue Agency (CRA);
- (c) That the current budgeted amount of \$3.87 million be maintained and used to fund both the Hamilton Wentworth Retirement Fund (HWRF) and the Hamilton Street Railway (HSR) special payments for the years 2011-2012 with any shortfall funded from the Hamilton Wentworth Retirement Fund (HWRF) Actuarial Deficiency Provision (112065).

**CARRIED**

**7. Master Trust Pension Investment Performance June 30, 2011 (FCS11083) (City Wide) (Item 5.7)**

**(Morelli/Pearson)**

That Report FCS11083, respecting the Master Trust Pension Investment Performance to June 30, 2011, be received.

**CARRIED**

**8. Freedom of Information Quarterly Report – July to September 2011 (CL11002(b)) (City Wide) (Item 5.8)**

**(Morelli/Pearson)**

That Report CL11002(b), respecting the Freedom of Information Quarterly Report – July to September 2011, be received.

**CARRIED**

**9. Audit Report 2011-04 - Hamilton Police Service - Cash Accounts & Revenue Processes (AUD11034) (City Wide) (Item 5.9)**

**(Pearson/Morelli)**

That Report AUD11034, respecting Audit Report 2011-04, Hamilton Police Service – Cash Accounts and Revenue Processes, be received.

**CARRIED**

**10. Audit Report 2011-02 - Hamilton Police Service - Property and Evidence Management Process (AUD11036) (City Wide) (Items 5.10 and 12.1)**

**(Pearson/Morelli)**

- (a) That Report AUD11036 and its Appendix, respecting Audit Report 2011-02 – Hamilton Police Service – Property and Evidence Management Process, be received;
- (b) That Appendix “A” to Report AUD11036 remain confidential and not for public release.

**CARRIED**

**11. Audit Report 2011-06 - Infectious Diseases Programs (AUD11027) (City Wide) (Item 5.11)**

**(Pearson/Morelli)**

- (a) That Report AUD11027 respecting Audit Report 2011-06, Infectious Diseases Programs, be received;
- (b) That the Management Action Plans as detailed in Appendix “A” of Report AUD11027 be approved; and
- (c) That the Medical Officer of Health be directed to instruct the appropriate staff to have the Management Action Plans (attached as Appendix “A” to Report AUD11027) implemented.

**CARRIED**

**12. Follow Up of Audit Report 2010-01 - Real Estate Asset Management (AUD11031) (City Wide) (Item 5.12)**

**(Pearson/Morelli)**

That Report AUD11031, respecting the follow up of Audit Report 2010-01, Real Estate Asset Management, be received.

**CARRIED**

**13. Audit Report 2011-07 - Stimulus Funding - Status of Construction Contracts Review (AUD11029) (City Wide) (Item 5.13)**

**(Morelli/Pearson)**

That Report AUD11029, respecting Audit Report 2011-07 - Stimulus Funding - Status of Construction Contracts Review, be received.

**CARRIED**

**14. 2012 Budget Requests – Volunteer Advisory Committees (FCS11101) (City Wide) (Item 5.15)**

**(Pearson/Morelli)**

That the Volunteer Advisory Committee 2012 base budget submissions be approved as follows and forwarded to the 2012 budget process (GIC):

- (a) Advisory Committee on Immigrants & Refugees in the amount of \$3,500;
- (b) Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Queer (LGBTQ) Advisory Committee in the amount of \$3,890;
- (c) Aboriginal Advisory Committee in the amount of \$3,500;
- (d) Hamilton Mundialization Committee in the amount of \$5,890;
- (e) Hamilton Status of Women Committee in the amount of \$3,500;
- (f) Committee Against Racism in the amount of \$3,890.

**CARRIED**

**15. Needs Assessment of the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Queer Community of Hamilton (FCS11104) (City Wide) (Item 7.1)**

**(Morelli/Pearson)**

- (a) That the Customer Service, Access and Equity Division work with the LGBTQ Advisory Committee of the City of Hamilton to address gaps and needs identified in the Needs Assessment of the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer (LGBTQ) Community of Hamilton in conjunction with the implementation of the Equity and Inclusion Policy.
- (b) That staff be directed to investigate the possibility of available space, within City facilities, for use by the LGBTQ Advisory Committee and its community partners to meet to carry out the recommendations outlined in Report FCS11104, the Needs Assessment of the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Queer Community of Hamilton.
- (c) That, should space not be available through the City, staff be directed to prepare a feasibility study respecting the requirements for that space, and report to the Audit, Finance & Administration Committee.
- (d) That staff be directed to report back to the Audit, Finance & Administration Committee, on a quarterly basis, respecting the status of the implementation of the Needs Assessment of the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, and Queer Community of Hamilton.

**AMENDMENT CARRIED  
MOTION AS AMENDED CARRIED**

**16. Award of Contract C12-08-11 Inventory Management & Supply of Engine Antifreeze (FCS11086) (City Wide) (Item 8.1)**

**(Pearson/Morelli)**

That the Request for Tenders C12-08-11 Inventory Management & Supply of Engine Antifreeze, be awarded to the lowest bid Barton Auto Parts Ltd., with an estimated annual expenditure of \$50,240.

**CARRIED**

**17. Implementation of the Hybrid Auditor General Model (AUD11028) (City Wide) (Item 8.2)**

**(Morelli/Pearson)**

That Report AUD11028, respecting the Implementation of the Hybrid Auditor General Model, be referred to the General Issues Committee for consideration.

**CARRIED**

**18. Auditor General Model (CM11006) (City Wide) (Item 8.2(b))**

**(Morelli/Pearson)**

That Report CM11006, respecting the Auditor General Model, as amended, be referred to the General Issues Committee for consideration.

**CARRIED**

**19. Governance Committee Report 11-005 (Item 8.3)**

**(Pearson/Morelli)**

**(a) 2012 Committee Calendar (Item 4.1)**

- (i) That the 2012 Committee/Council Calendar amended as follows, and attached as Appendix "A", be approved:
  - 1. That Board of Health meet on the third Monday of every month commencing at 1:30 p.m.;
  - 2. That the General Issues Committee meet on the first and third Wednesday of every month commencing at 9:30 a.m.;
  - 3. That the Emergency & Community Services Committee meet on the second Monday of every month commencing at 1:30 p.m.;
  - 4. That the Audit, Finance & Administration Committee meet on the second Monday of every month commencing at 9:30 a.m.;

5. That the amendments to the 2012 Committee/Council Calendar be implemented on a one year trial;

(ii) That staff be directed to prepare the necessary amendments to the Procedural By-law; and,

(iii) That staff be directed to report back to the Governance Review Sub-Committee prior the end of 2012 with the results of the one-year trial period.

**CARRIED**

**20. Development Charge Demolition Credit Extension Request – 119 and 121 Young Street, Hamilton (FCS11094) (Ward 2) (Item 8.4)**

**(Pearson/Morelli)**

That the Development Charge Demolition Credits for 119 & 121 Young St. be extended by 5 years – expiring July 5, 2014.

**CARRIED**

**21. 2011 Annual Accessibility Plan - Ontarians with Disabilities Act Report (FCS11095) (City Wide) (Item 8.5)**

**(Morelli/Pearson)**

(a) That the 2011 Annual Accessibility Plan for the City of Hamilton attached as Appendix “A” to Report FCS11095 be approved and be made available to the public;

(b) That the Advisory Committee for Persons with Disabilities be thanked for their advice and contribution towards the completion of the accessibility plan.

**CARRIED**

**22. Resignations from Various Volunteer Committees (Item 9.1)**

**(Pearson/Morelli)**

That the resignations from following Volunteer Committee’s be received:

(a) Status of Women Committee:

- (i) Debbie Sanche
- (ii) Liliana Cardona
- (iii) Shirley Molinaro

(b) Committee Against Racism:

- (i) Michelle Poirier

- (c) Advisory Committee for Immigrants & Refugees:
  - (i) Rita Giancarlo
  
- (d) Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender & Queer Advisory Committee:
  - (i) Ryan McComb

**CARRIED**

**23. Internal Audits respecting Hamilton Police Service (Added Item 9.2)**

**(Pearson/Morelli)**

- (a) That, upon reviewing its administrative authority of the powers vested to Council under the Police Services Act, it has been determined that the appropriate venue for consideration of future internal audit reports, regarding Hamilton Police Services, be before the Hamilton Police Services Board of Directors.
  
- (b) That forthcoming reports, prepared by the City of Hamilton's Internal Audit Division; when on the Division's Work Plan, be provided to the Audit, Finance & Administration Committee via a succinct Information Report.

**CARRIED**

**FOR THE INFORMATION OF COMMITTEE:**

**(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)**

The Committee Clerk advised of the following changes to the agenda:

- (i) Added as Item 8.2(b) – Report CM11006, respecting the Auditor General Model, as amended. (*Tabled at the June 8, 2011 AF&A meeting.*)
  
- (ii) Item 5.14 of the agenda, the September 8, 2011 Minutes of the Food & Shelter Advisory Committee, has been withdrawn as the Advisory Committee reports to the Emergency and Community Services Committee

**(Pearson/Morelli)**

That the agenda for the November 23, 2011 Audit, Finance & Administration Committee meeting be approved, as amended.

**CARRIED**

**(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)**

There were no declarations of interest.

**(c) APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 3)**

**(i) October 19, 2011 (Item 3.1)**

**(Pearson/Morelli)**

That the Minutes of the October 19, 2011 meeting of the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee be approved, as presented.

**CARRIED**

**(d) Needs Assessment of the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Queer Community of Hamilton (FCS11104) (City Wide) (Item 7.1)**

Marlon Picken, Chair of the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Queer Advisory Committee, addressed Committee respecting the Needs Assessment of the LGBTQ Community of Hamilton. Mr. Picken's comments included, but were not limited to, the following:

- Mr. Picken spoke in support of Report FCS11104, respecting the Needs Assessment of the LGBTQ Community in Hamilton.
- There are still gaps with respect to the aging and youth population.
- Youth suicide is staggering – 3 of 15 youth in our community have attempted suicide.
- The aging Baby Boomers are a generation that, for the most part, has not had the opportunity to come out or identify with our community structure. We must to determine how we are we going to address their needs.
- A secure, tangible, safe space is required to carry out the recommendations that are in the Assessment.
- The Advisory Committee is looking at a 3 year plan of engaging community stakeholders, such as the Community Wellness Centre of Hamilton, the Aids Network and bringing those partners together with the Positive Space Collaborative and the GLBTQ youth groups to build that space in order to carry out the work outlined in the Assessment recommendations.

**(Pearson/Morelli)**

That the presentation, respecting the Needs Assessment of the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Queer Community of Hamilton, be received.

**CARRIED**

**(e) Update on the Management Action Plan (Verbal Update) (Item 7.2)**

Helen Hale Tomasik, Executive Director of Human Resources & Organizational Development, provided an update regarding the Management Action Plan. Ms. Tomasik's comments included, but were not limited to, the following:

- On March 2, 2011, the Director, Audit Services presented a report on the Recruitment and Selection processes of Human Resources (AUD11011).
- The audit made a total of 31 recommendations related to the effectiveness and efficiency of City recruitment and selection processes including compliance with legislation, collective agreements, policies, procedures and guidelines.
- The audit can be summarized into 4 theme areas: development, review and updating policies and procedures to establish better controls and ensure adequate approvals; reviewing performance measures; making better use of technology; and, training hiring managers in regard to their responsibilities.
- At the subsequent Council meeting of March 9, 2011, staff was directed to provide a verbal update on the progress with the Management Action plan to the Audit, Finance & Administration Committee by the fourth quarter of 2011.

Diana Belaisis, Manager of Employment Services, addressed Committee. Ms. Belaisis' comments included, but were not limited to, the following:

- **Technology Related Action Items:**

There were a number of actions, which required enhancements to our current technology. The upgrade of the PeopleSoft enterprise system was completed in July.

The optimization of the recruitment modules, which was originally scheduled for 2012, has commenced. Staff are currently working on enhancing the existing functionality of the recruitment modules made available through the upgrade. This will be completed by February 2012 and those audit action items, which rely on technology, will subsequently be addressed as follows:

- Automation of data collection to enable reporting on performance measures; and,
- Review of information collected in competition files.

The cost of doing a fit gap analysis related to the use of Word Recognition Software was assumed within our optimization plan, at no additional cost. A report on the use and compatibility of Word Recognition Software, to assist with screening process, is scheduled for March 2012.

- **Policies and Procedures:**

Several policies have been drafted and are in various stages of approval, as noted in Report HUR11013, respecting Human Resources Employment Services Provided to Individual Departments (Item 5.14 on today's agenda):

- Recruitment & Selection Policy
- Request to Post and Fill a Position
- Temporary Deployment, Acting Appointments and Secondments
- Anti Nepotism Policy – Replaces Hiring of Relatives
- Eligibility for Reemployment Policy
- Succession Planning Policy

These policies relate specifically to Employment Services and the Audit recommendations and do not include other policy work completed by the Human Resources Department in 2011.

- **Offer Letters and Templates:**

All related Audit items that were agreed to have been completed.

- **Contracts & Controls related to External Advertising and Temporary Placement Agencies**

The audit recommended that Employment Services work with Purchasing to investigate opportunities to negotiate corporate contracts. The City's advertising contract expired May 31, 2011.

The RFP was issued in August, closed in September, and is being awarded this week. The costs associated with advertising positions is borne by the hiring departments; usually paid from the gapping of the vacant position.

The City's costs over the past 3 years have shifted from print media to 80% on-line advertisements. This has maximized the effectiveness of our expenditures and extended our reach significantly to attract qualified

candidates. The total expenditure for advertising has decreased over the last 3 years (2008 -\$126,700; 2009-\$114,000, 2010 - \$106,000).

The audit recommended that the Human Resources Department divest itself of the task of brokering the requests for temporary assistance by the departments, but be involved in control activities related to the use of temporary agency placements.

The audit further recommended that Human Resources work with Purchasing to investigate opportunities to negotiate corporate contracts. Human Resources has developed the terms and conditions, contained within the RFP, in a manner which requires the vendor of record to seek approval from Human Resources for assignments in excess of 8 weeks.

The vendor of choice will provide the services of 7 positions that the City uses most frequently at the best cost. The RFP will be released in December and we anticipate that a vendor will be selected early in the new year.

The procedure for Use of Temporary Agencies has been drafted. The internal procedure will require departments wanting to request a position, outside of the 7 positions identified in the RFP, to consult with Human Resources. HR will review the quarterly reports received from the vendor and will follow up on issues of concern with the appropriate Director.

**(Morelli/Pearson)**

That the verbal update, respecting the Management Action Plan, be received.

**CARRIED**

**(f) Auditor General Model (CM11006) (City Wide) (Item 8.2(b))**

**(Morelli/Pearson)**

That Report CM11006, respecting the Auditor General Model, be lifted from the table.

**CARRIED**

**(g) Development Charge Demolition Credit Extension Request – 119 and 121 Young Street, Hamilton (FCS11094) (Ward 2) (Item 8.4)**

Councillor B. Clark wished to be recorded as OPPOSED to Item 8.4.

**(h) Desktop Computer, Mobile Computer, Server & Storage Area Network  
Corporate Contract (FCS11022) (City Wide) (Item 8.6)**

**(Morelli/Pearson)**

That Report FCS11022, respecting the Desktop Computer, Mobile Computer, Server & Storage Area Network Corporate Contract, be referred back to staff for further review and information, and a report back to the December 7, 2011, Audit, Finance & Administration Committee.

**CARRIED**

**(i) GENERAL INFORMATION/OTHER BUSINESS (Item 11)**

**(i) Amendments to the Outstanding Business List:**

**(Morelli/Pearson)**

(a) That the following two outstanding business items be referred to the General Issues Committee, as per staff's request:

(i) Item "L" - Two Vacant Internal Audit Positions

(ii) Item "O" - Financial Obligations that the City will be required to Pay Out for the approx. 35% of the City's Work Force Expected to Retire within the Next Five Years

(b) That the following Items be removed from the Audit, Finance & Administration Committee's Outstanding Business List:

(i) Item "D" – LGBTQ Needs Assessment

(ii) Item "E" - Real Estate Asset Management (Item 5.12)

(iii) Item "H" – Update on Management Action Plan (Item 7.2)

(iv) Item "I" – HR Services Provided to Individual Departments (Item 5.4)

(v) Item "N" - Hybrid Auditor General Model – Terms of Reference and By-Law (Item 8.2)

(vi) Item "Q" – Auditor General Model (Item 8.2(b))

(vii) Item "R" - Vacant Lots – 119 Young Street and 121 Young Street, Hamilton – Request for Extension of the Development Charge Demolition Credit (Item 8.4)

**CARRIED**

**(j) PRIVATE AND CONFIDENTIAL (Item 12)**

**(i) Appendix "A" to Report AUD11036, respecting Audit Report 2011-02 - Hamilton Police Service - Property and Evidence Management Process (Item 12.1)**

**(Pearson/Morelli)**

That Committee move into Closed Session, at 11:00 a.m., respecting Appendix "A" to Report AUD11036, regarding Audit Report 2011-02 - Hamilton Police Service - Property and Evidence Management Process, pursuant to Section 8.1, sub-sections (a), (e) and (f) of the City's Procedural By-law 03-301 and Section 239, sub-sections (a), (e) and (f) of the Ontario Municipal Act, 2001, as amended, as the subject matter pertains to the security of the property of the municipality or local board, litigation or potential litigation, including matters before administrative tribunals, affecting the municipality or local board; and, the receiving of advice that is subject to solicitor-client privilege, including communications necessary for that purpose.

**CARRIED**

Committee reconvened in Open Session at 11:14 a.m.

**(ii) Closed Session Minutes - October 19, 2011**

**(Morelli/Pearson)**

That the Closed Session Minutes of the October 19, 2011 meeting of the Audit, Finance & Administration Committee be approved, as presented.

**CARRIED**

**(k) ADJOURNMENT (Item 13)**

**(Pearson/Morelli)**

That, there being no further business, the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee be adjourned at 11:27 a.m.

**CARRIED**

Respectfully submitted,

Councillor B. Clark, Chair  
Audit, Finance and Administration Committee

Stephanie Paparella  
Legislative Assistant  
November 23, 2011