



Hamilton

MINUTES HAMILTON LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee)

**Thursday, August 25, 2005
12:00 noon – Committee Room 110
Hamilton City Hall, 71 Main Street West, Hamilton**

Present: D. Dent (Chair), A. Charlton (Vice-Chair), D. Reid, P. Shaker, M. Stark, L. Toews, K. Wakeman, and A. Denham

Regrets: Councillor McHattie – Bereavement
Councillor M. Pearson, S. Wray, A. French - Vacation
W. Buchko

Also Present: D. Cuming, Sr. Project Manager, Community Planning & Design
S. Vattay, Cultural Heritage Planner
J. Muller, Cultural Heritage Planner
E. Scrivener, Exec. Director, Hospital Family Houses of Ontario
D. May, Hamilton Health Sciences
D. Wilson, Project Consultant, Mark Preece House
G. Kack, Vice President, MHPM Project Managers Inc.
P. Suwalski, Trow Associates Inc.
L. Baxter, Strathcona Community
S. Kapusin, Project Manager, Environmental Planning
H. Solomon, Manager, Traffic Engineering & Operations
B. Applebee, Traffic Technologist
J. Warner, Project Manager, Facilities
S. Paparella, Legislative Assistant, Office of the City Clerk

The meeting was called to order.

Chair Dent welcomed everyone to the meeting and noted that Councillor Pearson sent her regrets and that Councillor McHattie was absent due to the sudden loss of his sister, Michelle.

Condolences were expressed for Councillor McHattie and his family.

1. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 1)

There were none declared.

2. CHANGES TO AGENDA (Item 2)

The Clerk noted the following changes, which were approved:

- (i) Item 3.1 – Revised Minutes of the July 28, 2005 Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) meeting.
- (ii) E-mail from Councillor Pearson respecting Item 4.5
- (iii) Addition of Item 8.7 – Correspondence from the Ontario Heritage Foundation respecting the Heritage Community Recognition Program 2005.
- (iv) Added as Item 8.8, ICOMOS Canada 2005 Congress and Annual General Meeting Program.

3. MINUTES (Item 3)

A. Charlton noted the omission of a motion that was carried at the July 28, 2005, meeting, which should read as follows:

(Charlton/Reid)

That the remaining Book House be added to the Endangered Buildings List.

CARRIED

(Reid/Charlton)

That the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) meeting minutes, dated July 28, 2005, be approved, as amended.

CARRIED

4. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES

4.1 265 Mill Street South – Withdrawal of Designation Request (Item 6.1)

Staff (Community Planning & Design) was directed to send a letter to the property owners explaining the historical importance of the property and encourage them to reconsider their decision in withdrawing their request to have the property designated.

This item was noted as being complete.

4.2 Beach Lighthouse and Keeper's Cottage (Item 8.6.1)

Prior to amalgamation, a plaque had been approved by the City of Hamilton. An error had been found with the plaque, but it appears that a correction plaque had never been produced.

A. French is to speak to members of the Joint Plaquing Sub-Committee regarding this matter and to report back to Committee.

As there are no meetings of the Joint Plaquing Sub-Committee during the months of July and August, A. French will bring this item forward at the September meeting; subsequently, providing an update to the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) at its September 22, 2005 meeting.

(Toews/Charlton)

That Robin McKee be permitted to address the Committee respecting Item 4.2.

CARRIED

R. McKee informed the Committee that the site is named, by the reasons for designation, as the "Burlington Canal Lighthouse and Keeper's Dwelling", but it is known as the "Beach Lighthouse and Keeper's Cottage".

4.3 Smart-Turner Building, 191 Barton Street East, Hamilton, ON

Staff (Community Planning & Design) was requested to provide justification for the name Smart-Turner Building versus Smart-Turner-Hayward Building.

S. Vattay reported that the building has always colloquially been referred to as Smart-Turner, and that the company Smart-Turner was operating out of the building for over 90 years. It was known as the Smart-Turner-Hayward company for only 13 years.

4.4 Tivoli, 108 James Street North, Hamilton, ON; Protection Against Winter Conditions

That the Director of Building & Licensing was requested to provide comments as to whether or not the Tivoli Theatre, 108 James Street North is adequately protected for winter conditions in relation to the Property Standards By-law.

Standards & Licensing staff will perform an inspection at the site and an update will be provided at the September 22, 2005 meeting.

4.5 Tivoli, 108 James Street North, Hamilton, ON; Owners' Intentions

Committee suggested that both Councillors McHattie and Pearson arrange a meeting with the engineer and agent to speak to them in this

regard. The Councillors were asked to report back to the next Committee meeting.

Councillor Pearson provided comments respecting her discussions with Joe Venditti, the Engineer for the Sniderman family. Several interested parties have been shown the property, but nothing promising yet. As to the condition of the building, the northwest corner continues to have plaster falling in the stairwell. It was suggested that the building should be repaired before the winter. Currently, no services have been re-connected; however, the building is sealed and secured, and there have been no break-ins.

Mr. Venditti does not have any difficulty with respect to the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) promoting the building and referring prospective buyers to his attention. Councillor Pearson noted that Mr. Venditti feels that building has tremendous potential; however, the downfall is the apprehension by prospective buyers with respect to the cost implications.

5. APPLICATIONS FOR HERITAGE PERMITS

5.1 Heritage Permit Application (HP2005-016) Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act to Permit Alterations and Additions to a Designated Property at 129 York Road, Dundas (Ward 13)

(Reid/Toews)

That Council be advised that Heritage Permit (HP2005-016) be approved for the construction of additions and the replacement of windows to a detached residence at 129 York Road, Dundas, in accordance with the submitted drawings (as annotated) accompanying the permit application (attached as Appendix "A").

CARRIED

6. REQUESTS FOR HERITAGE DESIGNATION

6.1 Recommendation to Designate 191 Barton Street East, Hamilton, Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 2)

S. Vattay presented a staff report and provided a PowerPoint presentation that gave an overview of the cultural heritage assessment and the staff recommendation to designate 191 Barton Street East.

Elaine Scrivener, Executive Director – The Mark Preece Family House, a project of Hospital Family Houses of Ontario (HFHO), was permitted to address the Committee respecting the proposed site of the Mark Preece Family House at 191 Barton Street East, prior to the Committee voting on

Item 6.1 - Recommendation to Designate 191 Barton Street East, Hamilton, Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Ms. Scrivener provided the Committee with an overview of HFHO's vision and plan for the Mark Preece Family House; noting that the HFHO Board was requesting that the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) defer the designation of the property until the environmental and other technical studies can be completed. Upon receipt of the report, HFHO would attend a Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) meeting to discuss the matter further.

Ms. Scrivener also stated that she was unable to source grants for alterations of this kind.

D. Cuming noted that interest free loans were available through the Hamilton Community Trust Fund and reminded Committee members that Council had directed the Committee to ensure that the property was designated under the Ontario Heritage Act.

Don May, representing Hamilton Health Sciences (HHS) and Dennis Wilson, Project Consultant for the Mark Preece Family House were present in support of the HFHO's request to defer the recommendation to designate, in order that due diligence with respect to environmental studies may be completed. HHS and the HFHO would then jointly come forward with their proposal to the October 27, 2005, meeting of the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) for further discussions.

Copies of the Hamilton General Hospital Campus Master Plan and the context plan were circulated for the Committee's review. Both Mr. May and Mr. Wilson were available to answer Committee's questions.

Committee discussed the matter and most agreed to provide additional time to the HFHO and HHS to complete their environmental studies. Staff reiterated that members of Council had directed the Committee to make certain that the property was designated under the Ontario Heritage Act.

(Reid/Toews)

That the recommendation to designate 191 Barton Street East, Hamilton, under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act be deferred to the October 27, 2005, meeting of the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee). At that meeting, Hospital Family Houses of Ontario and Hamilton Health Sciences are to come forward with a joint report for the Committee's consideration.

CARRIED

K. Wakeman wished to be noted as OPPOSED to this motion.

7. PRESENTATIONS

7.1 Elaine Scrivener, Executive Director – The Mark Preece Family House

A brochure was distributed to all in attendance, which outlined the history and the objective, of Hospital Family Houses of Ontario, to build the Mark Preece Family House at the proposed location of 191 Barton Street, East, Hamilton, ON.

7.2 Ray/Pearl North Heritage District Proposal, Lee Baxter

Ms. Lee Baxter, representing the Strathcona Community, provided the Committee with a summary of the Ray/Pearl North Heritage District proposal to designate the area as a heritage district.

(Shaker/Wakeman)

That the Items 7.1 and 7.2. be received.

CARRIED

(Charlton/Shaker)

That staff be directed to prepare a report respecting the request to designate the Strathcona Community as a heritage district, and to report back to the Committee at the October 27, 2005 meeting.

7.3 Proposed Alterations (Marble Slabs) to Hamilton City Hall, 71 Main Street West, Hamilton, ON; Gordan Kack, Vice President, MHPM Project Managers Inc. (MHPM)

G. Kack provided a PowerPoint presentation to the Committee respecting the City Hall Renovation Plan and the immediate emergency repairs that are being undertaken. Mr. Kack was also available to answer the Committee's questions.

A more comprehensive report will be brought forward to the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) at a meeting in the first quarter of 2006.

(Stark/Charlton)

That the presentation be received.

CARRIED

7.4 York Boulevard Bike Lanes Class Environmental Assessment, Public Works

Sonya Kapusin, Project Manager, Environmental Planning, outlined the project to the Committee, as the City is investigating the opportunity of placing a community bike lane from the Burlington border to Downtown Hamilton. The Committee was also informed that the Class Environmental Assessment process would involve public consultation, review with public agencies and committees, such as the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee). As there are heritage criteria to be considered staff are requesting the Committee's input at various stages throughout the process.

H. Solomon, Manager, Traffic Engineering and Operations, noted that in order to reduce traffic congestion and air pollution in the City, alternate modes of transportation is a mandate for the Department. The bike lane would run from Dundurn Castle to the Burlington boundary, and potentially connect to Valley Inn Road. Mr. Solomon stated that they would like the Committee to review the plan, at the appropriate time, before moving forward, as it would involve widening of the sidewalk or a possible relocation of light poles on the bridge.

8. DISCUSSION ITEMS / NEW BUSINESS

8.1 Delegation of Council Consent to Staff for Alternations to Designated Property under the Ontario Heritage Act (City Wide)

Staff presented a report that provided an overview of new provisions in the recently amended Ontario Heritage Act that allow for the delegation to municipal staff of approvals for alterations to designated heritage properties. Staff indicated that an alternative that involved consultation with the Heritage Permit Review Subcommittee, the Cross-Melville District Advisory Committee and the Mill Street Heritage District Advisory Committee, prior to approval by the Director Development and Real Estate, appeared to be the most beneficial and efficient solution. Committee members expressed concern that the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) would have no direct role in approvals for alterations.

Staff advised that the time required for reporting back to the Committee and then on to the Director of Development and Real Estate might be counter-productive and contrary to the intent of delegation, which was to speed up the approval process.

(Shaker/Wakeman)

- (a) That Council be advised, that as per the provisions of the Ontario Heritage Act, that the power to consent to alterations to property

designated under the Ontario Heritage Act be delegated to the Director of Development and Real Estate, Planning and Economic Development Department, as per the draft By-law attached as Appendix A to this report, and as advised by the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee).

- (b) That the draft By-law, attached as Appendix A to this report, which has been prepared in a form satisfactory to Corporate Counsel, be forwarded to Council for enactment.

**AMENDMENT CARRIED
MOTION AS AMENDED CARRIED**

L. Toews noted that she wished to be recorded as OPPOSED to the amendment.

8.2 Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) By-law

There was no discussion on this item.

8.3 James Green Tool Shop, Northwest Corner of Upper Centennial and Green Mountain Road

Staff reported that the Nash Neighbourhood Secondary Plan is currently drafted and available for public view on the City's website. The Heritage and Urban Design Section has already commented on the significance of the cultural heritage resources within the study area, and these comments have been integrated into the Secondary Plan. Several buildings were identified as being of historical interest. Heritage Staff can consider the addition of the James Green Tool Shop to this list if further information about the building is delivered to the department.

8.4 Hamilton Sign Study Questionnaire Update

The Committee was advised that A. Denham sent a letter, on behalf of the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee), to Dan Mousseau, Coordinator, Sign By-law, offering the Committee's assistance as a resource, should it be required. A copy of the Sign By-law, which was passed by Council in the City of St. Johns, Newfoundland, was also provided for staff's reference.

8.5 Stinson Street School; Proposed Demolition

The Committee was advised that Heritage and Urban Design staff sent an e-mail to Judith Bishop, Hamilton-Wentworth District School Board

(HWDSB), which provided the HWDSB with information on the heritage status of Stinson Street School. It was also noted in the e-mail that due to the School's heritage status, any proposed alterations, additions or demolition would require a heritage permit. Therefore, Stinson Street School is protected from demolition or inappropriate alterations or additions, by the Ontario Heritage Act, until such time as City Council approves a heritage permit or de-designates the structure.

8.6 Heritage Site History and Importance – Media Releases

The Education Sub-committee was directed to discuss the possibility of preparing a series of releases respecting history and importance of various heritage sites (e.g. the Book House, etc.).

8.7 Correspondence from the Ontario Heritage Foundation respecting the Heritage Community Recognition Program 2005

Committee members were directed to give consideration to possible nominees (maximum of 5 nominations – 1 in each category), to complete the information requested on the form provided, and bring it forward at the September 22nd Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) meeting for discussion.

8.8 ICOMOS Canada 2005 Congress and Annual General Meeting Program

There was no discussion required on this item.

8.9 Gowlings, 1 Main Street West, Hamilton (Former Bank of Montreal)

Chair Dent asked the Committee if they had any objections to her inviting a representative from the legal firm of Gowlings to a future Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) meeting and requesting a tour of their building. There were no objections; therefore, this item will be placed on a future agenda.

8.10 Mission Statement

The Chair has received all member submissions, which were provided by the August 1st deadline, and will be bringing forward the final proposed Mission Statement at the Committee's meeting of September 22, 2005.

9. SUB-COMMITTEE REPORTS

9.1 Joint Plaquing Sub-committee Minutes

Summer Break - No meetings in July and August.

9.2 Heritage Permit Review Sub-committee

There was no update.

9.3 Education Sub-committee

There was no update.

9.4 Inventory and Research Sub-committee

There was no update.

9.5 Policy Sub-committee

There was no update.

9.6 Plaquing Priority Sub-committee

There was no update.

10. FOR THE INFORMATION OF THE COMMITTEE

10.1 Urban Design and Architecture Awards

S. Vattay distributed information about the City of Hamilton's Urban Design and Architecture Awards and encouraged the Committee to approach any property owners they feel are deserving of recognition for heritage restorations, renovations or adaptive reuse.

10.2 Victoria Hall

S. Vattay informed the Committee that she spoke with the new owners and there was a positive response to the option of re-use without making any major changes to the site. The owners have heeded the advice of staff and brought on consultants to advise them of any heritage impacts.

10.3 Former CIBC Building, 281 Herkimer Street, Hamilton

Staff advised that the City of Hamilton Real Estate Section of the Development and Real Estate Division (Planning and Economic Development Department) is in the process of formally declaring 281 Herkimer Street as surplus property. Heritage staff has been circulated for comments. Staff indicated that they will advise that the property is currently the subject of a cultural heritage assessment and that the property is worthy of designation.

10.4 Correspondence from the Regional Services Branch of the Ontario Ministries of Citizenship and Immigration, Culture and Tourism respecting Bilingual Services, dated August 11, 2005

10.5 Yorkey Investigations, Architectural / Historical Building Research

Promotional literature from this heritage consulting firm was received.

10.6 Brabant Editorial; Ancaster News: A House Divided Cannot Stand (August 12, 2005)

Staff was asked to comment on this editorial and D. Cuming advised that he would have expected the editorial to make some reference to City of Hamilton funding and other financial incentives available to the community and then make a comparison to other jurisdictions to see what was available.

Staff was asked to provide information about the grant/financing programs that are available in the City of Hamilton to Committee members.

10.7 Treble Hall

D. Reid has provided both Councillor McHattie and P. Shaker with the owner's contact information.

11. Adjournment

(Stark/Wakeman)

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 2:02 p.m.

CARRIED